

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
March 26, 2010

Plains Pipeline, L.P.
Trenton Station Expansion/Williams Cty
Siting Application

Case No. PU-05-184

Plains Pipeline, L.P.
Buford Expansion/McKenzie & Williams Cty
Siting Application

Case No. PU-05-185

On March 24, 2010, I received a call from Plains Pipeline, L.P. asking whether the Commission will be requiring additional plantings or will find Plains has met the tree and shrub mitigation requirements of the Commission orders in Case Nos. PU-05-184 and PU-05-185.

I recommend the Commission not require additional plantings at this time. The history of Plains' mitigation plantings indicates the survival rate a year from now could be below 75% and some of those plantings were made only one or two years ago.

I recommend that Plains continue to file annual reports on or shortly before October 1 of each year documenting the condition of the plantings.

Background

Plains Pipeline Trenton Expansion, Case No. PU-05-184

During the construction of the Trenton Expansion pipeline sited in Case No PU-05-184, 150 shrubs and 5 trees were destroyed. In the spring of 2006, Plains Pipeline, L.P. planted 300 shrubs and 10 trees for the tree and shrub mitigation. The Commission's October 5, 2005 order stated that the Commission may order additional plantings if survival rates are less than 75% of the required ration of two for one. A 75% survival rate is 7.5 trees and 225 shrubs.

Case No	Trees planted	Trees surviving	Shrubs planted	Shrubs surviving
PU-05-184				
Spring 2006	10 ponderosa		300	
Fall 2006		0		147
Spring 2007	10 ponderosa		160	
Fall 2007		0		213
Spring 2008	10 ponderosa		50	
Fall 2008		7		267

Spring 2009	10 ponderosa		50	
Fall 2009		8		260
	Trees planted	Trees surviving	Shrubs planted	Shrubs surviving
Summary	40 ponderosa	8	560	260
Required		7.5		225

At its October 8, 2008 administrative meeting, the Commission concluded that tree monitoring should continue, that additional trees should be planted (in 2009), that not additional shrubs should be planted at that time, and that Plains should continue to file annual reports on or shortly before October 1 of each year.

Plains Pipeline Buford Expansion PU-05-185

During the construction of the Buford Expansion pipeline sited in Case No PU-05-185, 250 shrubs and 50 trees were destroyed. In the spring of 2006, Plains Pipeline, L.P. planted 500 shrubs and 100 trees for the tree and shrub mitigation. The Commission's October 5, 2005 order stated that the Commission may order additional plantings if survival rates are less than 75% of the required ration of two for one. A 75% survival rate is 75 trees and 345 shrubs.

Case No PU-05-184	Trees planted	Trees surviving	Shrubs planted	Shrubs and trees surviving
Spring 2006 (original planting)	100		500	
Fall 2006				411
Spring 2007			110	
Fall 2007				404
Spring 2008			80	
Fall 2008				409
Spring 2009	50		50	
Fall 2009		91		332
	Trees planted	Trees surviving	Shrubs planted	Shrubs surviving
Summary	150	91	740	332
Required		75		345