

North Dakota Public Service Commission

Solicitation Number: 408.01.13.026

Case No. PU-12-813

<u>Evaluator</u>	<u>Blue Ridge</u>	<u>La Capra Associates</u>	<u>Mathai & Associates</u>	<u>Snavely King Majoros & Assoc.</u>	<u>Utility Financial Solutions, LLC</u>
Mike Diller	83	75	85	89	70
Sara Cardwell	76	76	90	90	68
<u>Average</u>	79.5	75.5	87.5	89.5	69

Signature:



Procurement Officer

Cara DeSaye

Date:

3/6/2013

NSP
 2013 Rate Increase Application
 3/6/13

Technical Evaluation Criteria	100 POINTS Maximum	Blue Ridge	La Capra Associates	Mathai & Associates	Snavely King Majoros & Assoc.	Utility Financial Solutions , LLC
1. Understanding of the Project	40	32	30	32	37	25
2. Methodology Used for the Project:	40	35	30	37	35	30
3. Experience and Qualifications:	15	12	12	12	13	12
4. Quality of Written Proposal	5	4	3	4	4	3
Evaluator Totals		83	75	85	89	70

3 4 2 1 5

less meat than Blue Ridge

Technical Evaluation Criteria	100 POINTS Maximum	Blue Ridge	La Capra Associates	Mathai & Associates	Snavey King Majoros & Assoc.	Utility Financial Solutions, LLC
1. Understanding of the Project	40	30 - could have read specific documents on case	30 - provided more specific information	35 - best specifics so far	38 better specifics	30 - not a lot of specifics focus on
2. Methodology Used for the Project:	40	35	35	40 - lots of discussion about frequent updates to commission	35 - little interactive discussion	30 - not very specific
3. Experience and Qualifications:	15	8 - limited nuclear, o&m, depreciation, salary, special rates, wind experience	8 - limited nuclear, o&m, depreciation, salary, wind experience	12 - better but still not a lot of nuclear background	10 - no nuclear or wind	5 do a lot of city / TUD work
4. Quality of Written Proposal	5	3 a little too wordy typos	3 better organized than Blue Ridge	3 not well organized and lots of typos	4 some typos	3 - nice looking but limited meat
Evaluator Totals		76 ③	76 ④	90 ②	90 ①	68 ⑤

ccos: rate design

591 hours 516 hours 656 hrs 663 528

Contacts discussed

III
4 Milestones of check in

III III Ø
IIII

★ do spell/grammar checks