

CenturyLink  
220 N 5th Street  
Bismarck, North Dakota 58501  
701 222 7051  
701 222 6976 fax

Kent Blickensderfer  
State Legislative Affairs Director



September 25, 2018

Mr. Darrell Nitschke  
Executive Secretary  
North Dakota Public Service Commission  
600 East Boulevard Avenue, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Bismarck, ND 58505-0480

**Re: In the Matter of Qwest Corporation dba CenturyLink QC's PIDs and PAP Revision  
Case No. PU-18-3**

Dear Mr. Nitschke:

Enclosed for filing are the following regarding the modified North Dakota Performance Assurance Plan:

1. Performance Results Report for the months of August 2017 through August 2018; and
2. Payment Report for the month of July 2018.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Kent Blickensderfer".

Kent Blickensderfer  
State Legislative Affairs Director

KB/bardm

Enclosures

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 25th day of September, 2018, the foregoing Performance Results Report for the months of August 2017 through August 2018 and the Payment Report for the month of July 2018 were served upon the following party:

Mr. Darrell Nitschke  
Executive Secretary  
North Dakota Public Service Commission  
600 East Boulevard Avenue, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Bismarck, ND 58505-0480

and copies sent electronically, addressed to the following:

Kent P. Blickensderfer  
State Legislative Affairs Director  
CenturyLink  
220 North 5<sup>th</sup> Street  
Bismarck, ND 58501

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Dianne Barthel



## ***Qwest Corporation (Qwest or CTL-Q) Performance Results***

### **North Dakota August 2017 - August 2018**

***Statistical parameters used to calculate whether PAP standards have been met or missed, and any applicable PAP payments, are sometimes required to be different than those used to calculate performance in this report. See the Reading Reports link on CenturyLink's Wholesale Website for details.***

September 11, 2018

CenturyLink QC Performance Results – Current 271 PID

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month       | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                      | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|-------------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|---------------------------------------|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| August 2018 | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                 | All                                   | Parity by Design | N/A       | 135            | 135              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors         | UNEs and Resale Aggregate             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 117,103        | 117,103          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors         | Reciprocal Compensation               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 344            | 344              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                         | UNEs and Resale Aggregate             | Parity           | N/A       | 175            | 175              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3,485           | 3,504             | 99.46%       | 7.34%                    | -0.95326         | -1.579541    |
| August 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                    | Reciprocal Compensation               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 344            | 344              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All   | LIDB                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3,791,558      | 3,736,924        | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All   | Directory Listing                     | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 555.47         | 3,027            | 0.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | IMAGUI                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | SIA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | XML                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                     | EBTA                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 43,200         | 43,200           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                     | RepairGUI                             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 42,180         | 42,180           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                         | EASE                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 27,960         | 27,960           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases  | ALL                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2           | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 2               | 2                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2           | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3              | 7                | 42.86%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2           | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 2                | 50.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2           | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 4                | 25.00%      | 43.30%                  | 2               | 2                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    | 0.841621         | -0.488331    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/i 24 hours               | Business                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 42              | 91                | 46.15%       | 49.85%                   | -1.511011        | -1.918629    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity           | N/A       | 5.02           | 2                | 2.31        | 0.18                    | 5.26            | 2                 | 2.43         | 1.11                     | -0.169705        | -1.103173    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity           | N/A       | 28.49          | 7                | 4.07        | 1.56                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity           | N/A       | 9.04           | 2                | 4.32        | 2.23                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 72.18          | 4                | 18.05       | 25.57                   | 5.26            | 2                 | 2.43         | 1.11                     | 0.855996         | -0.479591    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity           | N/A       | 777.48         | 31               | 25.05       | 85.02                   | 32330.03        | 340               | 95.05        | 213.35                   | -1.746855        | -2.062013    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 46               | 4.35%       | 20.39%                  | 2               | 193               | 1.04%        | 10.13%                   | 0.962137         | -0.415062    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 11,804           | 0.00%       |                         | 1               | 10,824            | 0.01%        | 0.96%                    | -0.72229         | -1.439121    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Residence                             | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 33               | 0.00%       |                         | 275             | 12,367            | 2.22%        | 14.75%                   | -0.865158        | -1.525979    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                   | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 2               | 191               | 1.05%        | 10.18%                   | -0.102601        | -1.062377    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity           | N/A       | 7              | 617              | 1.13%       | 10.59%                  | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    | -0.366178        | -1.22622     |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 153              | 1.31%       | 11.36%                  | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    | -0.325479        | -1.197877    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 4              | 453              | 0.88%       | 9.36%                   | 2               | 197               | 1.02%        | 10.02%                   | -0.154553        | -1.093961    |
| August 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity           | N/A       | 31             | 3,798            | 0.82%       | 9.00%                   | 375             | 21,258            | 1.76%        | 13.16%                   | -4.087147        | -3.484809    |
| August 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,560            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| August 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| August 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 1,560            | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 1               | 1                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 5              | 7                | 71.43%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 7              | 8                | 87.50%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 24             | 7                | 3.43        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 6              | 1                | 6.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord  | LNP                                   | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 95             | 95               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3286.28        | 11,838           | 0.28        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7545.61        | 8,278            | 0.91        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 10831.89       | 11,838           | 0.92        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)        | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 739.59         | 1,581            | 0.47        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)        | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 846.46         | 1,581            | 0.54        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 491.52         | 1,204            | 0.41        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 97.84          | 1,136            | 0.09        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 589.36         | 1,204            | 0.49        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1244.14        | 1,498            | 0.83        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 231.60         | 1,469            | 0.16        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1475.74        | 1,498            | 0.99        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3143.75        | 3,560            | 0.88        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6486.00        | 5,640            | 1.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 9629.75        | 3,560            | 2.71        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)     | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 434.59         | 448              | 0.97        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)     | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 142.76         | 448              | 0.32        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)     | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 577.35         | 448              | 1.29        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)   | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1358.89        | 3,452            | 0.39        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)   | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2272.86        | 6,866            | 0.33        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)   | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3631.75        | 3,452            | 1.05        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)         | ACCEPT                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23.00          | 225              | 0.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 251.48         | 490              | 0.51        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)         | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 286.95         | 225              | 1.28        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 561.43         | 490              | 1.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 685.11         | 1,664            | 0.41        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)         | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 38560.40       | 1,660            | 19.65       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 39245.51       | 1,664            | 23.59       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML) | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 10828.18       | 6,523            | 1.66        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)    | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1030.17        | 4,479            | 0.23        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7477392.00     | 7,176            | 19.45       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)            | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 25880.94       | 7,311            | 3.54        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)    | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 40974.96       | 4,568            | 8.97        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML) | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3991.25        | 775              | 5.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)      | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 19800.00       | 5,280            | 3.75        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 9368.80        | 3,346            | 2.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month       | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title  | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|-------------|---------------------------------|--------------|--|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5958.12        | 1,722            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 121            | 173              | 69.94%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2              | 3                | 66.67%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 63             | 92               | 68.48%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 121            | 126              | 96.03%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 63             | 63               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                  | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 229.49         | 60               | 3.50        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(a)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(b)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 55             | 55               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(c)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 112            | 112              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(a)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(b)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 43             | 43               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(c)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 41             | 41               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.      | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                    | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 9                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                  | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 118            | 118              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors          | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 122,445        | 122,445          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors          | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 308            | 308              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                          | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 232            | 232              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3,896           | 3,919             | 99.41%       | 7.64%                    | -1.137129        | -1.691325    |
| July 2018   | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                     | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 308            | 308              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All  | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4,960,887      | 4,670,943        | 1.06        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All  | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 661.77         | 3,458            | 0.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,060         | 30,060           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,060         | 30,060           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,060         | 30,060           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                      | EBTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 42,900         | 42,900           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                      | RepairGUI                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 41,820         | 41,820           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                          | EASE                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 26,880         | 26,880           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases   | ALL                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 1               | 3                 | 33.33%       | 47.14%                   | -1.224745        | -1.744592    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 7                | 14.29%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 5              | 6                | 83.33%      | 37.27%                  | 1               | 3                 | 33.33%       | 47.14%                   | -1.5             | -1.911935    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/1 24 hours                | Business                               | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 2                | 50.00%      | 50.00%                  | 36              | 105               | 34.29%       | 47.47%                   | -0.463795        | -1.281967    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 1:46           | 1                | 1:46        | 0.00                    | 32:08           | 3                 | 10:43        | 8.26                     | -0.919168        | -1.558814    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 51:39          | 1                | 51:39       | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 152:53         | 7                | 21:50       | 34:22                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 1:58           | 1                | 1:58        | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 18:26          | 6                | 3:04        | 1:21                    | 32:08           | 3                 | 10:43        | 8.26                     | -1.281906        | -1.779343    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 402:06         | 20               | 20:06       | 23:25                   | 2489:51         | 376               | 66:13        | 64:27                    | -3.117765        | -2.895466    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 3                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 7                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 6                | 50.00%      | 50.00%                  | 0               | 3                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    | 0.712443         | -0.566865    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 20               | 10.00%      | 30.00%                  | 69              | 424               | 16.27%       | 36.91%                   | -0.742761        | -1.451567    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 41               | 2.44%       | 15.43%                  | 3               | 199               | 1.51%        | 12.19%                   | -0.074703        | -1.045416    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 12,116           | 0.01%       | 0.91%                   | 0               | 11,088            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 33               | 0.00%       |                         | 305             | 12,541            | 2.43%        | 15.40%                   | -0.905767        | -1.550667    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                    | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 2               | 197               | 1.02%        | 10.02%                   | -0.101018        | -1.061415    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 7              | 630              | 1.11%       | 10.48%                  | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.381597        | -1.231994    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 159              | 0.63%       | 7.91%                   | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.838037        | -1.50949     |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 6              | 467              | 1.28%       | 11.26%                  | 3               | 203               | 1.48%        | 12.07%                   | -0.190295        | -1.115691    |
| July 2018   | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 20             | 3,876            | 0.52%       | 7.16%                   | 424             | 21,530            | 1.97%        | 13.89%                   | -5.994789        | -4.644573    |
| July 2018   | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,512            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| July 2018   | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 816              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/o TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 1,536            | 0.06%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| July 2018   | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/o TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 840              | 0.12%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 15             | 18               | 83.33%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 4              | 4                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 62             | 15               | 4.13        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 17             | 18               | 94.44%      | 22.91%                  | 67              | 72                | 93.06%       | 25.42%                   | -0.207328        | -1.126047    |
| July 2018   | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord   | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 144            | 144              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6428.73        | 19,481           | 0.33        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 16785.60       | 12,912           | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23214.33       | 19,481           | 1.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4091.07        | 4,929            | 0.83        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4634.07        | 4,929            | 0.94        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 927.57         | 1,893            | 0.49        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1438.94        | 1,398            | 1.03        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2367.51        | 1,893            | 1.25        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3075.82        | 3,751            | 0.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month     | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|-----------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5406.80        | 3,862            | 1.40        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8482.62        | 3,751            | 2.26        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8379.72        | 7,759            | 1.08        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6597.55        | 5,737            | 1.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14977.27       | 7,759            | 1.93        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2640.37        | 1,153            | 2.29        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 658.35         | 1,197            | 0.55        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3298.72        | 1,153            | 2.86        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4044.30        | 6,630            | 0.61        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8474.76        | 13,452           | 0.63        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 12519.06       | 6,630            | 1.89        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | ACCEPT                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 142.32         | 1,186            | 0.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 892.86         | 1,941            | 0.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1199.25        | 975              | 1.23        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2234.43        | 1,941            | 1.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2125.53        | 3,729            | 0.57        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 55510.51       | 2,917            | 19.03       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 57636.04       | 3,729            | 15.46       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8186.34        | 4,902            | 1.67        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8674.93        | 4,639            | 1.87        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 66661.40       | 6,862            | 9.70        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)              | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 25030.20       | 6,418            | 3.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48752.54       | 3,569            | 13.66       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4295.10        | 834              | 5.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)        | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 18659.10       | 5,043            | 3.70        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3950.10        | 3,591            | 1.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assign XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5909.04        | 1,698            | 3.48        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 125            | 153              | 81.70%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4              | 5                | 80.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48             | 60               | 80.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 125            | 127              | 98.43%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48             | 49               | 97.96%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3C        | LSRs received via facsimile                         | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2:22           | 1                | 2:22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                   | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 53:47          | 16               | 3:22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELs                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 45             | 45               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 119            | 119              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELs                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 20             | 20               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 25             | 25               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5C-(c)    | FOCs on Time for manual LSRs via Facsimile          | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 2                | 50.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.       | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| July 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                     | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 4                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                   | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 130            | 130              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 120,051        | 120,051          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 402            | 402              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 222            | 222              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 4,278           | 4,290             | 99.72%       | 5.28%                    | -0.769468        | -1.467804    |
| June 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                      | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 402            | 402              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All   | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4,242,133      | 4,119,370        | 1.03        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All   | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 601,72         | 3,272            | 0.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,340         | 29,340           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,340         | 29,340           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,340         | 29,340           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                       | EBTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 41,700         | 41,700           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                       | RepairGUI                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 40,485         | 40,485           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                           | EASE                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 26,580         | 26,580           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases    | ALL                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2              | 5                | 40.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 8                | 25.00%      | 43.30%                  | 1               | 2                 | 50.00%       | 50.00%                   | -0.083652        | -1.050857    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6B        | Mean Time to Restore disp out MSA                   | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 28:38          | 1                | 28:38       | 0.00                    | 2089:45         | 45                | 46:26        | 50:08                    | -0.35124         | -1.213539    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 22:55          | 5                | 4:35        | 2:14                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 64:01          | 8                | 8:00        | 5:08                    | 4:29            | 1                 | 4:29         | 0:00                     |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 274:16         | 37               | 7:25        | 6:32                    | 16260:22        | 404               | 40:15        | 40:03                    | -4.772999        | -3.901777    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7B        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Disp out MSA              | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 8               | 49                | 16.33%       | 36.96%                   | -0.437287        | -1.265851    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 5                | 40.00%      | 48.99%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 8                | 37.50%      | 48.41%                  | 1               | 2                 | 50.00%       | 50.00%                   | -0.316228        | -1.192253    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 37               | 2.70%       | 16.22%                  | 97              | 446               | 21.75%       | 41.25%                   | -2.698602        | -2.640633    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 41               | 0.00%       |                         | 2               | 199               | 1.01%        | 9.97%                    | -0.587482        | -1.357164    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 12,212           | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 11,256            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 49               | 2.04%       | 14.14%                  | 335             | 12,730            | 2.63%        | 16.01%                   | -0.257845        | -1.156759    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                    | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 2               | 197               | 1.02%        | 10.02%                   | -0.101018        | -1.061415    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 5              | 638              | 0.78%       | 8.82%                   | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.634561        | -1.385786    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 160              | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 8              | 475              | 1.68%       | 12.87%                  | 2               | 203               | 0.99%        | 9.88%                    | 0.297671         | -0.819029    |
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 37             | 3,919            | 0.94%       | 9.67%                   | 446             | 21,806            | 2.05%        | 14.15%                   | -4.494027        | -3.726095    |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month     | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|-----------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| June 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-9B        | Repair Appointments Met-Disp out MSA                | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 39              | 49                | 79.59%       | 40.30%                   | -0.50128         | -1.304757    |
| June 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl     | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,536            | 0.00%       | 0.02%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -2.991094    |
| June 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl        | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       | 0.02%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -2.990571    |
| June 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/o TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 1,536            | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl        | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 6              | 9                | 66.67%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 2              | 2                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 31             | 6                | 5.17        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                    | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                    | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 2                | 50.00%      | 50.00%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                    | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 9              | 9                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 73              | 79                | 92.41%       | 26.49%                   | -0.814906        | -1.495428    |
| June 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord    | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 625            | 627              | 99.68%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)       | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6620.14        | 19,471           | 0.34        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)       | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 16811.23       | 12,833           | 1.31        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)       | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23431.37       | 19,471           | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3989.25        | 4,925            | 0.81        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4602.44        | 4,925            | 0.93        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)      | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 930.51         | 1,899            | 0.49        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)      | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1421.88        | 1,394            | 1.02        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)      | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2352.39        | 1,899            | 1.24        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3035.07        | 3,747            | 0.81        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5787.00        | 3,858            | 1.50        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8822.07        | 3,747            | 2.35        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8293.57        | 7,751            | 1.07        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6424.32        | 5,736            | 1.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14717.89       | 7,751            | 1.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2628.92        | 1,148            | 2.29        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 646.92         | 1,198            | 0.54        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3275.84        | 1,148            | 2.85        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4041.25        | 6,625            | 0.61        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8739.25        | 13,445           | 0.65        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 12780.50       | 6,625            | 1.93        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | ACCEPT                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 163.24         | 1,166            | 0.14        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 833.77         | 1,939            | 0.43        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1244.16        | 972              | 1.28        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2241.17        | 1,939            | 1.16        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2082.08        | 3,718            | 0.56        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 55320.21       | 2,907            | 19.03       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 57402.29       | 3,718            | 15.44       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8150.60        | 4,910            | 1.66        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8720.46        | 4,614            | 1.89        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 66562.56       | 6,848            | 9.72        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)              | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 24369.40       | 6,413            | 3.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48550.32       | 3,549            | 13.68       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4253.90        | 826              | 5.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)        | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 18129.60       | 5,036            | 3.60        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3945.70        | 3,587            | 1.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac. Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5878.18        | 1,694            | 3.47        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 122            | 146              | 83.56%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3              | 4                | 75.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 68             | 80               | 85.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 122            | 124              | 98.39%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 68             | 69               | 98.55%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                   | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 35.26          | 17               | 2.05        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(a)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(b)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 54             | 54               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(c)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 117            | 117              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(a)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(b)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 13             | 13               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(c)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 20             | 20               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.       | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 8              | 8                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| June 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                     | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 4                | 25.00%      | 43.30%                  | 0               | 2                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                   | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 132            | 133              | 99.25%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 122,757        | 122,757          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 485            | 485              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 277            | 277              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3,097           | 3,107             | 99.68%       | 5.66%                    | -0.906201        | -1.550931    |
| May 2018  | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                      | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 485            | 485              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All   | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3,308,660      | 3,229,571        | 1.02        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All   | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 611.43         | 3,046            | 0.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                       | EBTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 43,200         | 43,200           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month    | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title  | Product Category                      | Standard   | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|----------|---------------------------------|--------------|--|---------------------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| May 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                      | RepairGUI                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 42,180         | 42,180           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                          | EASE                                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 27,960         | 27,960           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases   | ALL                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1              | 4                | 25.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 2                | 50.00%      | 50.00%                  | 2               | 2                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    | 0                | -1           |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/ 24 hours                 | Business                              | Parity     | N/A       | 4              | 7                | 57.14%      | 49.49%                  | 49              | 86                | 56.98%       | 49.51%                   | -0.008536        | -1.00519     |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 173.00         | 2                | 86.30       | 96.54                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 35.52          | 4                | 8.58        | 6.08                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 8.03           | 2                | 4.01        | 1.03                    |                 | 1                 | 0.31         | 0.00                     |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 246.42         | 25               | 9.52        | 23.01                   | 12239.37        | 301               | 40.40        | 41.17                    | -3.584386        | -3.179152    |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 4                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 1               | 2                 | 50.00%       | 50.00%                   | -1               | -1.607957    |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 2              | 25               | 8.00%       | 27.13%                  | 58              | 330               | 17.58%       | 38.06%                   | -1.212834        | -1.737351    |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 41               | 0.00%       |                         | 2               | 200               | 1.00%        | 9.95%                    | -0.586247        | -1.356413    |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 2              | 12,236           | 0.02%       | 1.28%                   | 0               | 11,376            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Residence                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 49               | 0.00%       |                         | 231             | 12,894            | 1.79%        | 13.26%                   | -0.943652        | -1.5737      |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                   | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 2               | 198               | 1.01%        | 10.00%                   | -0.100761        | -1.061258    |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 4              | 642              | 0.62%       | 7.87%                   | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.788537        | -1.479396    |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 166              | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 2              | 488              | 0.41%       | 6.39%                   | 2               | 204               | 0.98%        | 9.85%                    | -0.69456         | -1.422263    |
| May 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 25             | 3,995            | 0.63%       | 7.89%                   | 330             | 22,009            | 1.50%        | 12.15%                   | -4.180007        | -3.541264    |
| May 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1,584            | 0.00%       | 0.01%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/o TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 0              | 1,584            | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| May 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/o TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 8              | 8                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Benchmark  | 6.00      | 3              | 1                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark  | 6.00      | 30             | 6                | 5.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 7              | 8                | 87.50%      | 33.07%                  | 98              | 106               | 92.45%       | 26.42%                   | 0.016622         | -0.989895    |
| May 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord   | LNP                                   | Benchmark  | 95.00%    | 110            | 110              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6811.70        | 19,462           | 0.35        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 16679.00       | 12,830           | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 23490.70       | 19,462           | 1.21        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3934.40        | 4,918            | 0.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4619.35        | 4,918            | 0.94        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 946.00         | 1,892            | 0.50        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1404.91        | 1,391            | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2350.91        | 1,892            | 1.24        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3068.44        | 3,742            | 0.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6548.40        | 3,852            | 1.70        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 9616.84        | 3,742            | 2.57        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8209.70        | 7,745            | 1.06        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6303.00        | 5,730            | 1.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 14512.70       | 7,745            | 1.87        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2592.34        | 1,142            | 2.27        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 621.40         | 1,195            | 0.52        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3213.74        | 1,142            | 2.81        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4105.02        | 6,621            | 0.62        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8600.96        | 13,439           | 0.64        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 12705.98       | 6,621            | 1.92        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | ACCEPT                                | Diagnostic | N/A       | 174.45         | 1,163            | 0.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 813.54         | 1,937            | 0.42        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1249.30        | 961              | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2237.29        | 1,937            | 1.16        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2208.60        | 3,681            | 0.60        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 55215.06       | 2,903            | 19.02       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 57423.66       | 3,681            | 15.60       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)  | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8142.30        | 4,905            | 1.66        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8622.57        | 4,611            | 1.87        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)      | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 66699.75       | 6,841            | 9.75        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)             | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 25006.80       | 6,412            | 3.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 48558.43       | 3,547            | 13.69       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)  | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4171.50        | 810              | 5.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)       | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 18618.40       | 5,032            | 3.70        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)      | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3582.00        | 3,582            | 1.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 5854.32        | 1,692            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | LNP                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 92             | 112              | 82.14%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS       | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3              | 5                | 60.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Unbundled Loop Aggregate              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 88             | 115              | 76.52%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | LNP                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 92             | 95               | 96.84%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month      | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                      | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|------------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|---------------------------------------|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                    | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS       | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3              | 4                | 75.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                    | Unbundled Loop Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 88             | 89               | 98.88%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                 | Product Aggregate                     | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 19-10          | 11               | 1-45        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(a)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs            | Resale Aggregate                      | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(b)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs            | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS               | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 84             | 84               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(c)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs            | LNP                                   | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 86             | 86               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(a)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs           | Resale Aggregate                      | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(b)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs           | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS               | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 25             | 25               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(c)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs           | LNP                                   | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 15             | 15               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| May 2018   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.     | LIS Trunk                             | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                 | All                                   | Parity by Design | N/A       | 118            | 118              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors         | UNEs and Resale Aggregate             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 127,329        | 127,329          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors         | Reciprocal Compensation               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 419            | 419              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                         | UNEs and Resale Aggregate             | Parity           | N/A       | 271            | 271              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3,133           | 3,147             | 99.56%       | 6.65%                    | -1.055919        | -1.641953    |
| April 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                    | Reciprocal Compensation               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 419            | 419              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All   | LIDB                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2,700,581      | 2,637,971        | 1.02        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All   | Directory Listing                     | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 735.51         | 4,003            | 0.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | IMAGUI                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 28,980         | 28,980           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | SIA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 28,980         | 28,980           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | XML                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 28,980         | 28,980           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                     | EBTA                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 41,460         | 41,460           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                     | RepairGUI                             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 40,380         | 40,380           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                         | EASE                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 25,800         | 25,800           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases  | ALL                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2           | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3              | 4                | 75.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2           | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 3                | 33.33%      | 47.14%                  | 1               | 3                 | 33.33%       | 47.14%                   | 0                | -1           |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/i 24 hours               | Business                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 43              | 60                | 71.67%       | 45.06%                   | 1.338122         | -0.18648     |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity           | N/A       | 15-39          | 4                | 3.55        | 2.28                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 19-01          | 3                | 6.20        | 3.27                    | 25-27           | 3                 | 8-29         | 5-32                     | -0.474727        | -1.288614    |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity           | N/A       | 190-36         | 27               | 7.04        | 6.02                    | 9943-43         | 203               | 48-59        | 101-43                   | -2.012023        | -2.232233    |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 4                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 2               | 3                 | 66.67%       | 47.14%                   | -1.732051        | -2.053012    |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 27               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 28              | 227               | 12.33%       | 32.88%                   | -1.842597        | -2.120222    |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 41               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 3               | 209               | 1.44%        | 11.89%                   | -0.706516        | -1.429531    |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 12,260           | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 11,544            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Residence                             | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 49               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 157             | 13,132            | 1.20%        | 10.87%                   | -0.768574        | -1.46726     |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                   | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 3               | 207               | 1.45%        | 11.95%                   | -0.120976        | -1.073548    |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity           | N/A       | 4              | 656              | 0.61%       | 7.78%                   | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.802154        | -1.487675    |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 168              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 40                | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 498              | 0.60%       | 7.74%                   | 3               | 213               | 1.41%        | 11.78%                   | -0.83548         | -1.507936    |
| April 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity           | N/A       | 27             | 4,062            | 0.66%       | 8.13%                   | 227             | 22,314            | 1.02%        | 10.03%                   | -2.059844        | -2.252296    |
| April 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,584            | 0.00%       | 0.01%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -2.996364    |
| April 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.01%       | 0.06%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -2.970857    |
| April 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/o TGSR excl  | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 1,584            | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/o TGSR excl     | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.01%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15A       | Interval for Pending Orders Delayed Past Due Date | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity           | N/A       | 69             | 1                | 69.00%      | 0.00                    | 4,001           | 18                | 222.28       | 369.21                   | -0.404075        | -1.24566     |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15B-RD    | Pending Orders Delayed for Facilities             | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 10              | 18                | 55.56%       | 49.69%                   | 3.719016         | 1.261001     |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 0               | 2                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 7              | 7                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 5                | 20.00%      | 40.00%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 37             | 39               | 94.87%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 9              | 3                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 21             | 7                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Benchmark        | 5.50      | 24             | 4                | 6.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 86             | 19               | 4.53        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | LIS Trunk                             | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 3                | 66.67%      | 47.14%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity           | N/A       | 7              | 7                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity           | N/A       | 6              | 6                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity           | N/A       | 36             | 39               | 92.31%      | 26.65%                  | 60              | 61                | 98.36%       | 12.70%                   | 0.981612         | -0.403222    |
| April 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord  | LNP                                   | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 150            | 150              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7005.24        | 19,459           | 0.36        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 16524.90       | 12,810           | 1.29        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23530.14       | 19,459           | 1.21        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)        | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4025.38        | 4,909            | 0.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)        | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4637.55        | 4,909            | 0.94        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 754.00         | 1,885            | 0.40        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1344.72        | 1,293            | 1.04        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2098.72        | 1,885            | 1.11        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3175.60        | 3,736            | 0.85        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7296.00        | 3,840            | 1.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 10471.60       | 3,736            | 2.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8281.80        | 7,740            | 1.07        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6344.76        | 5,716            | 1.11        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14626.56       | 7,740            | 1.89        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month      | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title  | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|------------|---------------------------------|--------------|--|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2628.24        | 1,128            | 2.33        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 662.48         | 1,183            | 0.56        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3290.72        | 1,128            | 2.92        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4022.95        | 6,595            | 0.61        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8730.80        | 13,432           | 0.65        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 12753.75       | 6,595            | 1.93        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | ACCEPT                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 204.30         | 1,135            | 0.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 789.66         | 1,926            | 0.41        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1244.16        | 972              | 1.28        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2238.12        | 1,926            | 1.16        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2350.72        | 3,673            | 0.64        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 54321.00       | 2,850            | 19.06       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 56671.72       | 3,673            | 15.43       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)  | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8183.00        | 4,900            | 1.67        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)     | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8459.28        | 4,548            | 1.86        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 66416.76       | 6,833            | 9.72        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)             | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 24316.20       | 6,399            | 3.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)     | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48431.60       | 3,530            | 13.72       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)  | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4238.45        | 823              | 5.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 18111.60       | 5,031            | 3.60        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3359.00        | 3,359            | 1.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5823.18        | 1,683            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 173            | 201              | 86.07%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4              | 6                | 66.67%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 113            | 140              | 80.71%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 173            | 173              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4              | 5                | 80.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 113            | 114              | 99.12%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                  | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4              | 13               | 0.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 109            | 109              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 165            | 165              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 31             | 31               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 28             | 28               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.      | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| April 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                    | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 6                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 2                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                  | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 160            | 160              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors          | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 123,954        | 123,954          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors          | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 307            | 307              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                          | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 172            | 172              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 2,858           | 2,867             | 99.69%       | 5.59%                    | -0.71483         | -1.434586    |
| March 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                     | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 307            | 307              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All  | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7,152,455      | 7,069,660        | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All  | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 609.18         | 2,817            | 0.22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,420         | 30,420           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,420         | 30,420           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,420         | 30,420           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                      | EFTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 43,140         | 43,140           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                      | RepairGUI                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 41,925         | 41,925           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                          | EASE                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 27,660         | 27,660           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases   | ALL                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2            | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 3                | 33.33%      | 47.14%                  | 0               | 1                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2            | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 3                | 66.67%      | 47.14%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2            | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/i 4 Hours-Zone 2            | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 5              | 10               | 50.00%      | 50.00%                  | 0               | 1                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/i 24 hours                | Business                               | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 29              | 61                | 47.54%       | 49.94%                   | 1.00649          | -0.388098    |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 9.58           | 3                | 3.19        | 2.14                    | 9.35            | 1                 | 9.35         | 0.00                     |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 44.07          | 3                | 14.42       | 24.36                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 3.28           | 1                | 3.28        | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 50.28          | 10               | 5.03        | 3.32                    | 9.35            | 1                 | 9.35         | 0.00                     |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 250.35         | 27               | 9.17        | 6.54                    | 10684.57        | 258               | 41.25        | 49.36                    | -3.203455        | -2.947563    |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 1                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 3                | 33.33%      | 47.14%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 10               | 30.00%      | 45.83%                  | 0               | 1                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    | -0.604585        | -1.367562    |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 27               | 11.11%      | 31.43%                  | 29              | 280               | 10.36%       | 30.47%                   | -0.132925        | -1.080813    |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 41               | 7.32%       | 26.04%                  | 1               | 210               | 0.48%        | 6.88%                    | 2.183695         | 0.327592     |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 12,668           | 0.02%       | 1.54%                   | 0               | 11,520            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 49               | 0.00%       |                         | 209             | 13,357            | 1.56%        | 12.41%                   | -0.88094         | -1.535573    |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                    | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 1               | 208               | 0.48%        | 6.92%                    | -0.069338        | -1.042155    |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 670              | 0.15%       | 3.86%                   | 0               | 41                | 0.00%        |                          | -1.574679        | -1.957337    |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 161              | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 41                | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 10             | 519              | 1.93%       | 13.75%                  | 1               | 214               | 0.47%        | 6.82%                    | 1.16387          | -0.292417    |
| March 2018 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 27             | 4,148            | 0.65%       | 8.04%                   | 280             | 22,661            | 1.24%        | 11.05%                   | -3.134024        | -2.905351    |
| March 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc wi TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,632            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| March 2018 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc wi TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.01%       | 0.06%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -2.970857    |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month         | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title  | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|---------------|---------------------------------|--------------|--|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| March 2018    | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/o TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 1,632            | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/o TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.01%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15A       | Interval for Pending Orders Delayed Past Due Date  | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 48             | 1                | 48.00       | 0.00                    | 3,691           | 16                | 230.69       | 380.46                   | -0.465838        | -1.283209    |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15B-RD    | Pending Orders Delayed for Facilities              | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 7               | 16                | 43.75%       | 49.61%                   | 3.719016         | 1.261001     |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 4              | 15               | 26.67%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 160            | 15               | 10.67       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 14             | 15               | 93.33%      | 24.94%                  | 67              | 70                | 95.71%       | 20.25%                   | -0.1185          | -1.072043    |
| March 2018    | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord   | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 119            | 119              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6809.25        | 19,455           | 0.35        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 16426.24       | 12,833           | 1.28        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23235.49       | 19,455           | 1.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4022.92        | 4,906            | 0.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4634.58        | 4,906            | 0.94        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 748.80         | 1,872            | 0.40        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1346.10        | 1,282            | 1.05        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2094.90        | 1,872            | 1.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3171.35        | 3,731            | 0.85        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7282.70        | 3,833            | 1.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 10454.05       | 3,731            | 2.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8421.34        | 7,726            | 1.09        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6271.10        | 5,701            | 1.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14692.44       | 7,726            | 1.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2538.69        | 1,099            | 2.31        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 645.15         | 1,173            | 0.55        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3183.84        | 1,099            | 2.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4154.22        | 6,594            | 0.63        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8595.20        | 13,430           | 0.64        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 12749.42       | 6,594            | 1.93        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | ACCEPT                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 214.32         | 1,128            | 0.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 768.40         | 1,921            | 0.40        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1241.60        | 970              | 1.28        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2224.32        | 1,921            | 1.16        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2384.85        | 3,669            | 0.65        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 53797.20       | 2,824            | 19.05       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 56182.05       | 3,669            | 15.31       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)  | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8235.36        | 4,902            | 1.68        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)     | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8400.85        | 4,541            | 1.85        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 66387.79       | 6,823            | 9.73        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)             | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23661.50       | 6,395            | 3.70        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)     | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48345.00       | 3,516            | 13.75       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)  | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4191.21        | 817              | 5.13        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 18115.20       | 5,032            | 3.60        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3353.90        | 3,049            | 1.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5788.58        | 1,673            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 130            | 163              | 79.75%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4              | 8                | 50.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 83             | 109              | 76.15%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 130            | 130              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 83             | 83               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                  | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14.15          | 15               | 0.57        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(a)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(b)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 82             | 82               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(c)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 123            | 123              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(a)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(b)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 25             | 25               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(c)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 28             | 28               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.      | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| March 2018    | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                    | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 11               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 1                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                  | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 104            | 104              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors          | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 130,771        | 130,946          | 99.87%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors          | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 153            | 153              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                          | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 191            | 191              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3,078           | 3,088             | 99.68%       | 5.68%                    | -0.764452        | -1.464754    |
| February 2018 | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                     | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 153            | 153              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All  | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3,051,911      | 3,014,074        | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All  | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 617.60         | 2,597            | 0.24        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 27,360         | 27,360           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 27,360         | 27,360           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 27,360         | 27,360           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                      | EBTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 38,880         | 38,880           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                      | RepairGUI                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 37,860         | 37,860           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                          | EASE                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 24,720         | 24,720           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases   | ALL                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month         | PID Category              | PID          | PID Title  | Product Category                      | Standard   | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|---------------|---------------------------|--------------|--|---------------------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 2              | 5                | 40.00%      | 48.99%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/ 24 hours                 | Business                              | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 23              | 47                | 48.94%       | 49.99%                   | 0.593688         | -0.639064    |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 2.38           | 1                | 2.38        | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 27.21          | 5                | 5.28        | 3.32                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 84.53          | 4                | 21.13       | 2.38                    | 9313.33         | 155               | 60.05        | 96.46                    | -0.793077        | -1.482156    |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 5                | 20.00%      | 40.00%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 4                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 25              | 165               | 15.15%       | 35.86%                   | -0.835093        | -1.5077      |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 40               | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 210               | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 12,668           | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 11,808            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Residence                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 49               | 0.00%       |                         | 118             | 13,526            | 0.87%        | 9.30%                    | -0.655499        | -1.398515    |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                   | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 208               | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 678              | 0.15%       | 3.84%                   | 0               | 42                | 0.00%        |                          | -1.56892         | -1.953835    |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 162              | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 42                | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 5              | 524              | 0.95%       | 9.72%                   | 0               | 214               | 0.00%        |                          | 0.917438         | -0.442237    |
| February 2018 | Maintenance and Repair    | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 4              | 4,194            | 0.10%       | 3.09%                   | 169             | 22,924            | 0.74%        | 8.55%                    | -4.467545        | -3.716074    |
| February 2018 | Network Performance       | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1,536            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| February 2018 | Network Performance       | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| February 2018 | Network Performance       | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3              | 1,632            | 0.17%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Network Performance       | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-15A       | Interval for Pending Orders Delayed Past Due Date  | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 27             | 1                | 27.00       | 0.00                    | 13,636          | 20                | 681.80       | 1062.52                  | -0.601417        | -1.365636    |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-15B-RD    | Pending Orders Delayed for Facilities              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 9               | 20                | 45.00%       | 49.75%                   | 3.719016         | 1.261001     |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 1               | 2                 | 50.00%       | 50.00%                   | -0.816497        | -1.496395    |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 3              | 6                | 50.00%      | 50.00%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 15             | 15               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Benchmark  | 5.50      | 42             | 4                | 10.50       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark  | 6.00      | 64             | 14               | 4.57        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 2               | 2                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 6              | 6                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 12             | 15               | 80.00%      | 40.00%                  | 50              | 54                | 92.59%       | 26.19%                   | 0.958154         | -0.417484    |
| February 2018 | Ordering and Provisioning | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord   | LNP                                   | Benchmark  | 95.00%    | 244            | 244              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6613.00        | 19,450           | 0.34        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 16679.00       | 12,830           | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 23292.00       | 19,450           | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3970.62        | 4,902            | 0.81        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4561.18        | 4,902            | 0.93        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 729.30         | 1,870            | 0.39        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1354.68        | 1,278            | 1.06        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2083.98        | 1,870            | 1.11        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3131.52        | 3,728            | 0.84        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 7273.20        | 3,828            | 1.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 10404.72       | 3,728            | 2.79        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 7800.23        | 7,723            | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6515.04        | 5,817            | 1.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 14315.27       | 7,723            | 1.85        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2402.40        | 1,092            | 2.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 631.26         | 1,169            | 0.54        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3033.66        | 1,092            | 2.78        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4020.51        | 6,591            | 0.61        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8191.69        | 13,429           | 0.61        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 12212.20       | 6,591            | 1.85        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | ACCEPT                                | Diagnostic | N/A       | 225.00         | 1,125            | 0.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 800.52         | 1,906            | 0.42        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1234.44        | 972              | 1.27        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2259.96        | 1,906            | 1.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2343.68        | 3,662            | 0.64        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 53720.19       | 2,817            | 19.07       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 56063.87       | 3,662            | 15.31       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)  | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8281.00        | 4,900            | 1.69        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8211.97        | 4,537            | 1.81        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)      | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 66387.84       | 6,816            | 9.74        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)             | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 24874.20       | 6,378            | 3.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 47998.71       | 3,501            | 13.71       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)  | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4177.92        | 816              | 5.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)       | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 17633.00       | 5,038            | 3.50        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)      | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3345.10        | 3,041            | 1.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 5750.52        | 1,662            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | LNP                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 115            | 143              | 80.42%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS       | Diagnostic | N/A       | 5              | 6                | 83.33%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Unbundled Loop Aggregate              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 44             | 59               | 74.58%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | LNP                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 115            | 115              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS       | Diagnostic | N/A       | 5              | 6                | 83.33%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering              | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Unbundled Loop Aggregate              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 44             | 44               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month         | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|---------------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                 | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 12.01          | 9                | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs            | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs            | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 40             | 40               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs            | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 110            | 110              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs           | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs           | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 14             | 14               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs           | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 22             | 22               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.     | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| February 2018 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                   | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 3                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                 | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 146            | 146              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors         | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 125,657        | 125,657          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors         | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 212            | 212              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                         | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 196            | 197              | 99.49%      | 7.11%                   | 3,049           | 3,072             | 99.25%       | 8.62%                    | -0.380525        | -1.231343    |
| January 2018  | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                    | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 212            | 212              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All   | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3,365,176      | 3,322,461        | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All   | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 793.68         | 3,539            | 0.22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                     | EBTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 43,200         | 43,200           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                     | RepairGUI                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 42,180         | 42,180           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                         | EASE                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 27,960         | 27,960           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases  | ALL                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/1 4 Hours-Zone 2           | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/1 4 Hours-Zone 2           | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2              | 3                | 66.67%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/1 4 Hours-Zone 2           | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 4              | 4                | 75.00%      | 43.30%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/1 24 hours               | Business                               | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 28              | 58                | 48.28%       | 49.97%                   | 0.58217          | -0.646066    |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 7.27           | 1                | 7.27        | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 37.45          | 3                | 12.35       | 16.34                   | 1.33            | 1                 | 1.33         | 0.00                     |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 9.03           | 4                | 2.16        | 1.42                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 393.42         | 24               | 16.24       | 18.59                   | 22277.07        | 232               | 96.01        | 167.58                   | -2.210608        | -2.343954    |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 1                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 4                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 4              | 24               | 16.67%      | 37.27%                  | 25              | 255               | 9.80%        | 29.74%                   | 0.743442         | -0.548019    |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 40               | 2.50%       | 15.61%                  | 0               | 203               | 0.00%        | 0.97569                  | -0.406823        |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 12,644           | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 11,808            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 49               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 185             | 13,728            | 1.35%        | 11.53%                   | -0.816682        | -1.496507    |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                    | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 201               | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 681              | 0.44%       | 6.62%                   | 1               | 42                | 2.38%        | 15.25%                   | -0.80054         | -1.486694    |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 162              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 1               | 42                | 2.38%        | 15.25%                   | -0.901935        | -1.548337    |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 4              | 520              | 0.77%       | 8.74%                   | 0               | 207               | 0.00%        | 0.64063                  | -0.810525        |              |
| January 2018  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 24             | 4,230            | 0.57%       | 7.51%                   | 255             | 23,150            | 1.10%        | 10.44%                   | -3.060493        | -2.860648    |
| January 2018  | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,632            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| January 2018  | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| January 2018  | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 1,632            | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15A       | Interval for Pending Orders Delayed Past Due Date | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 1                | 2.00%       | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15A       | Interval for Pending Orders Delayed Past Due Date | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 7              | 1                | 7.00%       | 0.00                    | 13,411          | 25                | 536.44       | 977.22                   | -0.531261        | -1.322984    |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15B-RD    | Pending Orders Delayed for Facilities             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15B-RD    | Pending Orders Delayed for Facilities             | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 12              | 25                | 48.00%       | 49.96%                   | 3.719016         | 1.261001     |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 1               | 1                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 10             | 14               | 71.43%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 6              | 1                | 6.00%       | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 6              | 2                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Benchmark        | 5.50      | 10             | 1                | 10.00       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 57             | 11               | 5.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 1               | 1                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 14             | 14               | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 47              | 51                | 92.16%       | 26.88%                   | -0.966882        | -1.587823    |
| January 2018  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord  | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 120            | 120              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6825.00        | 19,500           | 0.35        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 16396.80       | 12,810           | 1.28        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23221.80       | 19,500           | 1.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)        | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4073.64        | 4,908            | 0.83        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)        | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4700.09        | 4,908            | 0.96        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 694.20         | 1,780            | 0.39        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1281.86        | 1,198            | 1.07        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1976.06        | 1,780            | 1.11        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3200.06        | 3,721            | 0.86        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6863.40        | 3,813            | 1.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 10063.46       | 3,721            | 2.70        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month         | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|---------------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7764.88        | 7,688            | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6576.60        | 5,820            | 1.13        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14341.48       | 7,688            | 1.87        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2371.77        | 1,083            | 2.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 615.86         | 1,162            | 0.53        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2987.63        | 1,083            | 2.76        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3952.80        | 6,588            | 0.60        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8055.60        | 13,426           | 0.60        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 12008.40       | 6,588            | 1.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | ACCEPT                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 262.20         | 1,140            | 0.23        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 817.00         | 1,900            | 0.43        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1227.50        | 982              | 1.25        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2306.70        | 1,900            | 1.21        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2303.28        | 3,656            | 0.63        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 53435.25       | 2,805            | 19.05       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 55738.53       | 3,656            | 15.25       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8545.56        | 4,828            | 1.77        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8260.98        | 4,539            | 1.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 67087.44       | 6,902            | 9.72        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)              | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 25444.00       | 6,361            | 4.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48308.19       | 3,493            | 13.83       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4110.60        | 806              | 5.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)        | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 17119.00       | 5,035            | 3.40        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3636.00        | 3,030            | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac. Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5522.16        | 1,596            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 123            | 155              | 79.35%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 54             | 77               | 70.13%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 123            | 123              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 54             | 54               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                   | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 92.36          | 28               | 3.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 49             | 49               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 114            | 114              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 23             | 23               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 27             | 27               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.       | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| January 2018  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                     | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 5                | 40.00%      | 48.99%                  | 0               | 5                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                   | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 129            | 129              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 128,444        | 128,444          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 334            | 334              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 246            | 246              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3,363           | 3,374             | 99.67%       | 5.70%                    | -0.866002        | -1.526492    |
| December 2017 | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                      | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 334            | 334              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All   | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2,688,404      | 2,661,445        | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All   | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 683.60         | 3,128            | 0.22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,880         | 29,880           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,880         | 29,880           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,880         | 29,880           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                       | EFTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 42,840         | 42,840           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                       | Repair/GUI                             | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 41,565         | 41,565           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                           | EASE                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 26,580         | 26,580           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases    | ALL                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 1               | 2                 | 50.00%       | 50.00%                   | 0                | -1           |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3              | 4                | 75.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 50.00%      | 50.00%                  | 1               | 2                 | 50.00%       | 50.00%                   | 0                | -1           |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/ 24 hours                  | Business                               | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 3                | 66.67%      | 47.14%                  | 35              | 71                | 49.30%       | 50.00%                   | -0.58948         | -1.358378    |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 24.58          | 2                | 12.29       | 4.27                    | 5.31            | 1                 | 5.31         | 0.00                     |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 15.53          | 4                | 3.58        | 0.48                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 31.24          | 2                | 15.42       | 19.51                   | 5.31            | 1                 | 5.31         | 0.00                     |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 358.22         | 24               | 14.56       | 20.03                   | 18225.08        | 227               | 80.17        | 181.36                   | -1.676692        | -2.019357    |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 2                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 4                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 2                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 24               | 12.50%      | 33.07%                  | 34              | 241               | 14.11%       | 34.81%                   | -0.215793        | -1.131193    |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 39               | 5.13%       | 22.06%                  | 2               | 195               | 1.03%        | 10.08%                   | 1.124329         | -0.316457    |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 12,548           | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 11,832            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 50               | 0.00%       |                         | 165             | 13,931            | 1.18%        | 10.82%                   | -0.727761        | -1.469805    |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                    | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 2               | 193               | 1.04%        | 10.13%                   | -0.102065        | -1.062051    |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 4              | 690              | 0.58%       | 7.59%                   | 0               | 43                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.788502        | -1.479375    |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 163              | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 43                | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 524              | 0.38%       | 6.17%                   | 2               | 199               | 1.01%        | 9.97%                    | -0.750511        | -1.456278    |
| December 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 24             | 4,268            | 0.56%       | 7.48%                   | 241             | 23,427            | 1.03%        | 10.09%                   | -2.777325        | -2.688494    |
| December 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc wi TGSR excl     | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,632            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| December 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc wi TGSR excl        | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| December 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/o TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 1,632            | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month         | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|---------------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| December 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/o TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15A       | Interval for Pending Orders Delayed Past Due Date   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 1                | 3.00        | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15A       | Interval for Pending Orders Delayed Past Due Date   | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00        | 0.00                    | 14,059          | 27                | 520.70       | 933.12                   | -0.761467        | -1.462939    |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15B-RD    | Pending Orders Delayed for Facilities               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-15B-RD    | Pending Orders Delayed for Facilities               | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 12              | 27                | 44.44%       | 49.69%                   | -1.220514        | -1.74202     |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 4              | 5                | 80.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 2              | 2                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                               | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 30             | 6                | 5.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                    | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                    | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                    | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 6              | 6                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 50              | 55                | 90.91%       | 28.75%                   | -0.735516        | -1.447162    |
| December 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord    | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 110            | 110              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)       | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6822.90        | 19,494           | 0.35        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)       | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 16262.35       | 12,805           | 1.27        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)       | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23085.25       | 19,494           | 1.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4022.10        | 4,905            | 0.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4611.22        | 4,905            | 0.94        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)      | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 678.30         | 1,785            | 0.38        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)      | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1329.48        | 1,231            | 1.08        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)      | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2007.78        | 1,785            | 1.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3235.53        | 3,719            | 0.87        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7239.00        | 3,810            | 1.90        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 10474.53       | 3,719            | 2.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7843.80        | 7,690            | 1.02        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6640.50        | 5,825            | 1.14        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14484.30       | 7,690            | 1.88        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2354.40        | 1,080            | 2.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 626.94         | 1,161            | 0.54        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2981.34        | 1,080            | 2.76        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3885.15        | 6,585            | 0.59        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7920.75        | 13,425           | 0.59        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 11805.90       | 6,585            | 1.79        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | ACCEPT                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 282.50         | 1,130            | 0.25        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 873.54         | 1,899            | 0.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1226.36        | 989              | 1.24        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2382.40        | 1,899            | 1.25        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2482.00        | 3,650            | 0.68        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5333.04        | 2,801            | 1.94        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 55813.04       | 3,650            | 15.29       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8588.50        | 4,825            | 1.78        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8251.88        | 4,534            | 1.82        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 67146.73       | 6,901            | 9.73        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)              | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 26733.00       | 6,365            | 4.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48301.60       | 3,490            | 13.84       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4000.00        | 800              | 5.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)        | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 17608.50       | 5,031            | 3.50        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3926.00        | 3,020            | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac. Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5518.70        | 1,595            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 105            | 144              | 72.92%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2              | 4                | 50.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 46             | 68               | 67.65%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 105            | 105              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 46             | 46               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                   | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 75.01          | 23               | 3.16        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(a)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(b)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 42             | 42               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(c)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 102            | 102              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(a)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(b)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 22             | 23               | 95.65%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(c)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 31             | 31               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.       | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| December 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                     | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 9                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 2                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                   | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 148            | 148              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 130,295        | 130,375          | 99.94%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 166            | 166              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 284            | 284              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3,948           | 3,961             | 99.67%       | 5.72%                    | -0.934127        | -1.567909    |
| November 2017 | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                      | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 166            | 166              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All   | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3,000,507      | 2,972,123        | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All   | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1132.03        | 2,945            | 0.38        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,520         | 29,520           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,520         | 29,520           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,520         | 29,520           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                       | EBTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 41,760         | 41,760           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month         | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title  | Product Category                      | Standard   | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|---------------|---------------------------------|--------------|--|---------------------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| November 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                      | Repair/GUI                            | Diagnostic | N/A       | 40,740         | 40,740           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                          | EASE                                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 26,880         | 26,880           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases   | ALL                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3               | 3                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Diagnostic | N/A       | 0              | 5                | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 4                | 25.00%      | 43.30%                  | 3               | 3                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    | 1.204047         | -0.267991    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/24 hours                  | Business                              | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 4                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 14              | 62                | 22.58%       | 41.81%                   | 0.316975         | -0.807293    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity     | N/A       | 3.27           | 1                | 3.27        | 0.00                    | 3.10            | 2                 | 1.35         | 0.27                     | 0.062707         | -0.961877    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 114.49         | 5                | 22.58       | 21.09                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 1.56           | 1                | 1.56        | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 49.03          | 4                | 12.16       | 9.12                    | 3.10            | 2                 | 1.35         | 0.27                     | 1.066938         | -0.351348    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 359.49         | 18               | 19.59       | 17.45                   | 26330.50        | 272               | 96.48        | 108.07                   | -2.919194        | -2.774744    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 3                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 5                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 4                | 25.00%      | 43.30%                  | 0               | 3                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    | -0.180012        | -1.10944     |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 2              | 18               | 11.11%      | 31.43%                  | 43              | 284               | 15.14%       | 35.84%                   | -0.462534        | -1.281201    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 39               | 2.56%       | 15.81%                  | 3               | 196               | 1.53%        | 12.28%                   | -0.046596        | -1.028328    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 12,929           | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 11,928            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Residence                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 50               | 0.00%       |                         | 214             | 14,159            | 1.51%        | 12.20%                   | -0.874414        | -1.531606    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                   | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 3               | 194               | 1.55%        | 12.34%                   | -0.125005        | -1.075998    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 5              | 696              | 0.72%       | 8.45%                   | 0               | 43                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.644542        | -1.391854    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 1              | 165              | 0.61%       | 7.76%                   | 0               | 43                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.817817        | -1.497198    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 4              | 542              | 0.74%       | 8.56%                   | 3               | 200               | 1.50%        | 12.16%                   | -0.757704        | -1.460651    |
| November 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 18             | 4,348            | 0.41%       | 6.42%                   | 284             | 23,745            | 1.20%        | 10.87%                   | -4.361244        | -3.851448    |
| November 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1,200            | 0.00%       | 0.01%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -2.9928      |
| November 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 504              | 0.07%       | 0.19%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -2.782857    |
| November 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/o TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 19             | 1,632            | 1.18%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/o TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 15             | 840              | 1.83%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 2              | 5                | 40.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 28             | 32               | 87.50%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Benchmark  | 6.00      | 15             | 5                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark  | 6.00      | 113            | 25               | 4.52        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 31             | 32               | 96.88%      | 17.40%                  | 49              | 52                | 94.23%       | 23.32%                   | -0.504755        | -1.30687     |
| November 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord   | LNP                                   | Benchmark  | 95.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6626.60        | 19,490           | 0.34        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 16112.88       | 12,788           | 1.26        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 22739.48       | 19,490           | 1.17        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3969.00        | 4,900            | 0.81        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4521.00        | 4,900            | 0.92        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 694.20         | 1,780            | 0.39        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1306.98        | 1,233            | 1.06        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2001.18        | 1,780            | 1.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3196.62        | 3,717            | 0.86        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 7612.00        | 3,806            | 2.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 10808.62       | 3,717            | 2.91        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 7868.17        | 7,639            | 1.03        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6576.60        | 5,820            | 1.13        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 14444.77       | 7,639            | 1.89        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2345.77        | 1,081            | 2.17        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 644.00         | 1,150            | 0.56        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2989.77        | 1,081            | 2.77        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3817.56        | 6,582            | 0.58        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 7784.18        | 13,421           | 0.58        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 11601.74       | 6,582            | 1.76        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | ACCEPT                                | Diagnostic | N/A       | 270.72         | 1,128            | 0.24        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 890.65         | 1,895            | 0.47        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1201.70        | 985              | 1.22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2363.07        | 1,895            | 1.25        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2428.75        | 3,625            | 0.67        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 51723.54       | 2,718            | 19.03       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 54152.29       | 3,625            | 14.94       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)  | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8483.20        | 4,820            | 1.76        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8195.68        | 4,528            | 1.81        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)      | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 67068.00       | 6,900            | 9.72        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)             | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 26084.20       | 6,362            | 4.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 48252.87       | 3,489            | 13.83       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)  | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4074.90        | 799              | 5.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)       | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 17068.00       | 5,020            | 3.40        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)      | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3922.10        | 3,017            | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 5515.24        | 1,594            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | LNP                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 131            | 161              | 81.37%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS       | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1              | 5                | 20.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Unbundled Loop Aggregate              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 57             | 81               | 70.37%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month         | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title  | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|---------------|---------------------------------|--------------|--|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                   | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 131            | 131              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                   | Resale Aggregate w/O UNE-P-FOTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                   | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 57             | 57               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 20.48          | 9                | 2.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(a)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs           | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(b)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs           | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 51             | 51               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A(c)     | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs           | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 125            | 125              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(a)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs          | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(b)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs          | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELS                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 25             | 25               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B(c)     | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs          | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 25             | 25               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5C(c)     | FOCs on Time for manual LSRs via Facsimile       | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.    | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| November 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                  | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 12               | 8.33%       | 27.64%                  | 0               | 4                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 136            | 138              | 98.55%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 131,932        | 132,238          | 99.77%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors        | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 154            | 154              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 240            | 240              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 3,617           | 3,625             | 99.78%       | 4.69%                    | -0.705595        | -1.428971    |
| October 2017  | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                   | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 154            | 154              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All  | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3,626,449      | 3,599,644        | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All  | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 917.35         | 4,019            | 0.23        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                       | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,060         | 30,060           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                       | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,060         | 30,060           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                       | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,060         | 30,060           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                    | EFTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 42,900         | 42,900           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                    | RepairGUI                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 41,820         | 41,820           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                        | EASE                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 26,880         | 26,880           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases | ALL                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2            | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 3                | 66.67%      | 47.14%                  | 2               | 4                 | 50.00%       | 50.00%                   | -0.436436        | -1.265334    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2            | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3              | 6                | 50.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2            | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2              | 4                | 50.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2            | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 7                | 28.57%      | 45.18%                  |                 | 4                 | 50.00%       | 50.00%                   | 0.076032         | -0.953776    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6A        | Mean Time to Restore-Disp w/ MSA                 | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 73.56          | 1                | 73.56       |                         | 20441:31        | 241               | 84.49        | 173.57                   | -0.062453        | -1.037969    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6B        | Mean Time to Restore disp out MSA                | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 4.29           | 1                | 4.29        | 0.00                    | 3963:52         | 30                | 132:08       | 316:15                   | -0.397069        | -1.241401    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2             | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 9.58           | 3                | 3:19        | 1.00                    | 43:06           | 4                 | 10:46        | 16:49                    | -0.580493        | -1.352914    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 31:00          | 6                | 5:10        | 2:17                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2             | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 17:39          | 4                | 4:25        | 1:49                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 38:48          | 7                | 5:33        | 4:21                    | 43:06           | 4                 | 10:46        | 16:49                    | -0.496592        | -1.301906    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2             | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 270:09         | 23               | 11:45       | 10:06                   | 29340:41        | 354               | 82:53        | 180:19                   | -1.833465        | -2.114667    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7A        | Repair Repeat Rpt Rate-Disp w/ MSA               | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 35              | 245               | 14:29%       | 34.99%                   | -0.407418        | -1.247692    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7B        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Disp out MSA           | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 4               | 30                | 13.33%       | 33.99%                   | -0.385854        | -1.234583    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                 | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 3                | 33.33%      | 47.14%                  | 0               | 4                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    | 0.180012         | -0.890556    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                 | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 6                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 | 4                 | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                 | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 4                | 25.00%      | 43.30%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                 | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 7                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 4                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                 | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 23               | 8.70%       | 28.18%                  | 51              | 372               | 13.71%       | 34.39%                   | -0.678467        | -1.412479    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                     | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 40               | 7.50%       | 26.34%                  |                 | 194               | 2.06%        | 14.21%                   | 1.28844          | -0.216684    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                     | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 12,764           | 0.00%       |                         | 0               | 11,833            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                     | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 50               | 4.00%       | 19.60%                  | 290             | 14,402            | 2.01%        | 14.05%                   | 0.618789         | -0.623803    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                     | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                    | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         | 4               | 192               | 2.06%        | 14.28%                   | -0.145487        | -1.08845     |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                     | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 6              | 704              | 0.85%       | 9.19%                   | 0               | 43                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.523839        | -1.318472    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                     | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 4              | 176              | 2.27%       | 14.90%                  | 0               | 43                | 0.00%        |                          | 0.216456         | -0.868404    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                     | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 7              | 552              | 1.27%       | 11.19%                  | 4               | 198               | 2.02%        | 14.07%                   | -0.645317        | -1.392325    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                     | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 23             | 4,368            | 0.53%       | 7.24%                   | 372             | 24,077            | 1.55%        | 12.33%                   | -5.021178        | -4.052659    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-9A        | Repair Appointments Met-Disp w/ MSA              | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 154             | 245               | 62.86%       | 48.32%                   | 0.321321         | -0.804651    |
| October 2017  | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-9B        | Repair Appointments Met-Disp out MSA             | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 20              | 30                | 66.67%       | 47.14%                   | -0.695608        | -1.4229      |
| October 2017  | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Cfc w/ TGSR excl  | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,632            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| October 2017  | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Cfc w/ TGSR excl  | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| October 2017  | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Cfc w/o TGSR excl | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 1,632            | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Cfc w/o TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                            | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 1               | 1                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                            | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                            | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 16             | 17               | 94.12%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                            | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 86             | 17               | 5.06        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                 | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 2               | 2                 | 100.00%      | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                 | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                 | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 17             | 17               | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 90              | 96                | 93.75%       | 24.21%                   | -0.98124         | -1.596552    |
| October 2017  | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 77             | 77               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)    | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6631.70        | 19,505           | 0.34        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)    | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 15987.50       | 12,790           | 1.25        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)    | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 22619.20       | 19,505           | 1.16        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)       | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3917.60        | 4,897            | 0.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)       | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4438.10        | 4,897            | 0.91        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)   | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 698.00         | 1,745            | 0.40        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)   | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1291.50        | 1,230            | 1.05        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)   | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1989.50        | 1,745            | 1.14        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017  | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)        | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3157.75        | 3,715            | 0.85        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month          | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|----------------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7986.30        | 3,803            | 2.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 11144.05       | 3,715            | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7782.60        | 7,630            | 1.02        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6512.80        | 5,815            | 1.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                  | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14295.40       | 7,630            | 1.87        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2382.72        | 1,088            | 2.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 662.36         | 1,142            | 0.58        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)       | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3045.08        | 1,088            | 2.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3751.17        | 6,581            | 0.57        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7772.00        | 13,400           | 0.58        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 11523.17       | 6,581            | 1.75        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | ACCEPT                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 253.00         | 1,100            | 0.23        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 864.80         | 1,880            | 0.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1187.01        | 981              | 1.21        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2304.81        | 1,880            | 1.23        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2498.49        | 3,621            | 0.69        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 51544.20       | 2,710            | 19.02       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)           | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 54042.69       | 3,621            | 14.92       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8440.25        | 4,823            | 1.75        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8141.40        | 4,523            | 1.80        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 67107.81       | 6,897            | 9.73        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)              | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 26670.00       | 6,350            | 4.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 48371.80       | 3,485            | 13.88       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)   | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3999.60        | 792              | 5.05        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)        | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 17552.50       | 5,015            | 3.50        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3612.00        | 3,010            | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assign XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5504.86        | 1,591            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 139            | 186              | 74.73%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 12             | 13               | 92.31%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                 | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 83             | 104              | 79.81%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 139            | 139              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 12             | 12               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                      | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 83             | 83               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                   | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 23.50          | 18               | 1:19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 12             | 12               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELs                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 82             | 82               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs              | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 130            | 130              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELs                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 22             | 22               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 44             | 44               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.       | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| October 2017   | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                     | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 4                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                   | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 138            | 138              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 132,921        | 132,921          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors           | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 175            | 175              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                           | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 240            | 241              | 99.59%      | 6.43%                   | 4,181           | 4,199             | 99.57%       | 6.53%                    | -0.03174         | -1.019297    |
| September 2017 | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                      | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 175            | 175              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All   | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5,203,914      | 4,733,144        | 1.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All   | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 566.60         | 2,472            | 0.23        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,340         | 29,340           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | SIA                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,340         | 29,340           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                          | XML                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 29,340         | 29,340           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                       | EBTA                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 41,700         | 41,700           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                       | RepairGUI                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 40,485         | 40,485           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                           | EASE                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 26,580         | 26,580           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases    | ALL                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2              | 3                | 66.67%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2               | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 5                | 40.00%      | 48.99%                  | 1               | 3                 | 33.33%       | 47.14%                   | -0.193649        | -1.11773     |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/24 hours                   | Business                               | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 36              | 97                | 37.11%       | 48.31%                   | -0.338888        | -1.206029    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 106.37         | 2                | 53.19       | 10.23                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 6.30           | 3                | 2.10        | 2.47                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 4.32           | 1                | 4.32        | 0.00                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 21.56          | 5                | 4.23        | 1.44                    | 25:29           | 2                 | 12.44        | 7.43                     | -1.293666        | -1.786493    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2                | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 520.16         | 32               | 16.16       | 13.36                   | 50087:36        | 402               | 124.36       | 180.10                   | -3.27382         | -2.990341    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 2                | 50.00%      | 50.00%                  |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 5                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 1               | 3                 | 33.33%       | 47.14%                   | -0.968246        | -1.588652    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                    | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 32               | 9.38%       | 29.15%                  | 51              | 421               | 12.11%       | 32.63%                   | -0.457781        | -1.278311    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 42               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 3               | 199               | 1.51%        | 12.19%                   | -0.728577        | -1.442943    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 2              | 12,692           | 0.02%       | 1.26%                   | 0               | 12,000            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | Residence                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 50               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 317             | 14,677            | 2.16%        | 14.54%                   | -1.048815        | -1.637634    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                    | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 3               | 197               | 1.52%        | 12.25%                   | -0.12404         | -1.075411    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 710              | 0.42%       | 6.49%                   | 0               | 44                | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month          | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title  | Product Category                       | Standard         | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|----------------|---------------------------------|--------------|--|--|------------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded     | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 190              | 0.53%       | 7.24%                   | 0               | 44                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.885164        | -1.538141    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 5              | 564              | 0.89%       | 9.37%                   | 3               | 203               | 1.48%        | 12.07%                   | -0.59872         | -1.363996    |
| September 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                       | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 32             | 4,435            | 0.72%       | 8.46%                   | 421             | 24,459            | 1.72%        | 13.01%                   | -4.70963         | -3.863252    |
| September 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 1,608            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| September 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                              | Parity           | N/A       | 0              | 816              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| September 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl    | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 1,632            | 0.05%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl       | LIS Trunk                              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1              | 840              | 0.09%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 3              | 4                | 75.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 6              | 2                | 3.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                              | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Benchmark        | 6.00      | 46             | 4                | 11.50       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE       | Parity           | N/A       | 5              | 5                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable           | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                   | Unbundled Loop Analog                  | Parity           | N/A       | 3              | 4                | 75.00%      | 43.30%                  | 79              | 91                | 86.81%       | 33.83%                   | 0.124162         | -0.924515    |
| September 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord   | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 269            | 269              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6435.00        | 19,500           | 0.33        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 15360.00       | 12,800           | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)      | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 21795.00       | 19,500           | 1.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3963.33        | 4,893            | 0.81        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)         | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4484.27        | 4,893            | 0.92        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 696.00         | 1,740            | 0.40        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1254.24        | 1,206            | 1.04        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)     | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1950.24        | 1,740            | 1.12        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3118.08        | 3,712            | 0.84        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7980.00        | 3,800            | 2.10        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 11098.08       | 3,712            | 2.99        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7699.23        | 7,623            | 1.01        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6555.13        | 5,801            | 1.13        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                 | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 14254.36       | 7,623            | 1.87        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2374.02        | 1,089            | 2.18        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 649.80         | 1,140            | 0.57        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)      | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3023.82        | 1,089            | 2.78        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3684.80        | 6,580            | 0.56        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 7859.39        | 13,321           | 0.59        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)    | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 11544.19       | 6,580            | 1.75        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | ACCEPT                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 252.31         | 1,097            | 0.23        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 860.20         | 1,870            | 0.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 1176.00        | 980              | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2288.51        | 1,870            | 1.22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | REQUEST                                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 2461.60        | 3,620            | 0.68        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | RESPONSE                               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5155.12        | 2,712            | 19.01       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)          | TOTAL                                  | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5406.72        | 3,620            | 14.92       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML)  | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8243.91        | 4,821            | 1.71        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)     | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 8047.38        | 4,521            | 1.78        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 67019.40       | 6,895            | 9.72        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)             | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 26446.14       | 6,342            | 4.17        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)     | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 47981.96       | 3,482            | 13.78       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML)  | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3997.40        | 790              | 5.06        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)       | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 17581.59       | 5,009            | 3.51        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 3615.60        | 3,013            | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5501.40        | 1,590            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 158            | 196              | 80.61%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6              | 7                | 85.71%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2A        | All Electronic LSRs                                | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 53             | 73               | 72.60%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | LNP                                    | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 158            | 158              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 6              | 6                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-2B        | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 53             | 53               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-3X        | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                  | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 5-44           | 8                | 0-43        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 6              | 6                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELs                | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 47             | 49               | 95.92%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5A-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 95.00%    | 156            | 156              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(a)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(b)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELs                | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 23             | 23               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5B-(c)    | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | LNP                                    | Benchmark        | 90.00%    | 33             | 33               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-5D        | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.      | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark        | 85.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| September 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-9B        | Unbundled Loops                                    | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity           | N/A       | 1              | 1                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 0               | 10                | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| August 2017    | Billing                         | BI-2         | Invoices Delivered within 10 Days                  | All                                    | Parity by Design | N/A       | 133            | 133              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017    | Billing                         | BI-3A        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors          | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 138,304        | 138,304          | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017    | Billing                         | BI-3B        | Billing Accuracy - Adjustments for Errors          | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 157            | 157              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017    | Billing                         | BI-4A        | UNEs and Resale Aggregate                          | UNEs and Resale Aggregate              | Parity           | N/A       | 220            | 220              | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 5,892           | 5,901             | 99.85%       | 3.90%                    | -0.569184        | -1.346039    |
| August 2017    | Billing                         | BI-4B        | Reciprocal Compensation (MOU):                     | Reciprocal Compensation                | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 157            | 157              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017    | Database Updates                | DB-1B        | All  | LIDB                                   | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 4,803,802      | 4,428,264        | 1.08        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017    | Database Updates                | DB-1C-1      | All  | Directory Listing                      | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 784,21         | 3,640            | 0.22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017    | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                         | IMAGUI                                 | Diagnostic       | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month       | PID Category                    | PID          | PID Title   | Product Category                      | Standard   | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|-------------|---------------------------------|--------------|---|---------------------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| August 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | SIA                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-1         | Gateway Availability - LSR                        | XML                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 30,600         | 30,600           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                     | EBTA                                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 43,200         | 43,200           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-3         | Gateway Availability - Repair                     | RepairGUI                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 42,180         | 42,180           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-4         | System Availability - ASR                         | EASE                                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 27,960         | 27,960           | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Electronic Gateway Availability | GA-7         | Timely Outage Resolution after Software Releases  | ALL                                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 0              | 0                |             |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2             | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1              | 6                | 33.33%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2             | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 50.00%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5B        | All Troubles Cleared w/4 Hours-Zone 2             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 4              | 7                | 57.14%      | 49.49%                  | 3               | 5                 | 60.00%       | 48.99%                   | -0.494133        | -1.300412    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-5X        | Out of Service cleared w/4 hours                  | Business                              | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 18              | 85                | 21.18%       | 40.86%                   | -0.324196        | -1.197097    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 16.59          | 3                | 5.40        | 0.05                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 76.32          | 6                | 12.45       | 11.31                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 14.10          | 2                | 7.05        | 4.39                    |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 25.09          | 7                | 3.36        | 2.04                    | 17:01           | 5                 | 3:24         | 3:33                     | 0                | -1           |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-6E        | Mean Time to Restore Interval Zone 2              | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 433.33         | 40               | 10.50       | 10.20                   | 37588:11        | 373               | 100:46       | 118:14                   | -4.571804        | -3.77946     |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 3                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 6                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 7                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 5                 | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-7E        | Repair Repeat Report Rate-Zone 2                  | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 9              | 40               | 22.50%      | 41.76%                  | 70              | 447               | 15.66%       | 36.34%                   | 0.909914         | -0.446811    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Enhanced Extended Loops - DS1 Capable | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 42               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 5               | 199               | 2.51%        | 15.65%                   | -0.945424        | -1.574777    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 3              | 12,692           | 0.02%       | 1.54%                   | 0               | 11,808            | 0.00%        |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Residence                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 51               | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 341             | 14,980            | 2.28%        | 14.91%                   | -1.088099        | -1.661517    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | SUB-LOOP UNBUNDLING                   | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 5               | 197               | 2.54%        | 15.73%                   | -0.160966        | -1.097861    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 6              | 713              | 0.84%       | 9.13%                   | 0               | 45                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.500942        | -1.304551    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop - 2 Wire Non-Loaded    | Parity     | N/A       | 2              | 192              | 1.04%       | 10.15%                  | 0               | 45                | 0.00%        |                          | -0.400629        | -1.243565    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 7              | 580              | 1.21%       | 10.92%                  | 5               | 203               | 2.46%        | 15.50%                   | -0.993811        | -1.604194    |
| August 2017 | Maintenance and Repair          | MR-8         | Trouble Rate                                      | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 40             | 4,481            | 0.89%       | 9.41%                   | 447             | 24,829            | 1.80%        | 13.30%                   | -4.205827        | -3.556961    |
| August 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1A        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 1,584            | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| August 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1B        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                             | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  | -3           |
| August 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1C        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q Tandem Ofc w/ TGSR excl   | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1              | 1,632            | 0.05%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Network Performance             | NI-1D        | Trunk Blockage to CTL-Q End Ofc w/ TGSR excl      | LIS Trunk                             | Diagnostic | N/A       | 0              | 840              | 0.00%       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-3E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 11             | 11               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Benchmark  | 5.50      | 26             | 2                | 13.00       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-4E        | Interval Zone 2 Areas                             | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Benchmark  | 6.00      | 75             | 15               | 5.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | UNBUNDLED LOOP - ADSL COMPATIBLE      | Parity     | N/A       | 4              | 4                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | Unbundled Loop - DS1 Capable          | Parity     | N/A       | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-5A        | New Service Installation Quality                  | Unbundled Loop Analog                 | Parity     | N/A       | 20             | 20               | 100.00%     | 0.00%                   | 115             | 122               | 94.26%       | 23.26%                   | -1.022706        | -1.621761    |
| August 2017 | Ordering and Provisioning       | OP-8C        | Number Portability Timeliness without Loop Coord  | LNP                                   | Benchmark  | 95.00%    | 343            | 343              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6681.68        | 19,652           | 0.34        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 16737.50       | 12,875           | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation)     | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 23419.18       | 19,652           | 1.19        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)        | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4329.60        | 4,920            | 0.88        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler)        | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 4853.48        | 4,920            | 0.99        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 725.70         | 1,770            | 0.41        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1329.80        | 1,220            | 1.09        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Assignment)    | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2055.50        | 1,770            | 1.16        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3024.00        | 3,600            | 0.84        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 7991.55        | 3,717            | 2.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 11015.55       | 3,600            | 3.06        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 7900.00        | 7,900            | 1.00        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 6840.00        | 5,700            | 1.20        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR)                | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 14740.00       | 7,900            | 1.87        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)     | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2343.50        | 1,090            | 2.15        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)     | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 860.00         | 1,200            | 0.55        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry)     | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3003.50        | 1,090            | 2.76        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)   | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3380.00        | 6,500            | 0.52        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)   | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 7920.00        | 13,200           | 0.60        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Availability)   | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 11300.00       | 6,500            | 1.74        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)         | ACCEPT                                | Diagnostic | N/A       | 274.50         | 1,098            | 0.25        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 855.00         | 1,900            | 0.45        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)         | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 1261.00        | 970              | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2390.50        | 1,900            | 1.26        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)         | REQUEST                               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 2590.00        | 3,700            | 0.70        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)         | RESPONSE                              | Diagnostic | N/A       | 51415.95       | 2,699            | 19.05       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-IMA GUI | Pre-Order Response Times(Loop Qual Tools)         | TOTAL                                 | Diagnostic | N/A       | 54005.95       | 3,700            | 14.60       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Address Validation XML) | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8160.00        | 4,800            | 1.70        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Appt. Scheduler XML)    | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 8214.31        | 4,589            | 1.79        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Facility Check XML)     | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 67824.35       | 6,985            | 9.71        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Get CSR XML)            | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 27392.00       | 6,400            | 4.28        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Loop Qual Tools XML)    | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 47913.06       | 3,477            | 13.78       |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Meet Point Inquiry XML) | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3956.40        | 785              | 5.04        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering                    | PO-1-XML     | Pre-Order Response Times (Service Avail XML)      | XML Request/Response                  | Diagnostic | N/A       | 17500.00       | 5,000            | 3.50        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |

Aug 2018 PAP Aggregate Performance Results ND.xls

| Month       | PID Category | PID       | PID Title  | Product Category                       | Standard   | Benchmark | CLEC Numerator | CLEC Denominator | CLEC Result | CLEC Standard Deviation | CTL-Q Numerator | CTL-Q Denominator | CTL-Q Result | CTL-Q Standard Deviation | Modified Z Score | Parity Score |
|-------------|--------------|-----------|--|--|------------|-----------|----------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-1-XML  | Pre-Order Response Times (TN Reservation XML)      | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3900.00        | 3,000            | 1.30        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-1-XML  | Pre-Order Response Times(Connecting Fac Assgn XML) | XML Request/Response                   | Diagnostic | N/A       | 5781.66        | 1,671            | 3.46        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-2A     | All Electronic LSRs                                | LNP                                    | Diagnostic | N/A       | 186            | 249              | 74.70%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-2A     | All Electronic LSRs                                | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3              | 7                | 42.86%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-2A     | All Electronic LSRs                                | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 61             | 83               | 73.49%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-2B     | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | LNP                                    | Diagnostic | N/A       | 186            | 187              | 99.47%      |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-2B     | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Resale Aggregate W/O UNE-P-POTS        | Diagnostic | N/A       | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-2B     | All Flow-through Eligible LSRs                     | Unbundled Loop Aggregate               | Diagnostic | N/A       | 61             | 61               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-3X     | Electronic LSRs Rejected Manually                  | Product Aggregate                      | Diagnostic | N/A       | 54:21          | 23               | 2:22        |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-5A-(a) | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark  | 95.00%    | 3              | 3                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-5A-(b) | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELs                | Benchmark  | 95.00%    | 59             | 59               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-5A-(c) | FOCs on Time for Fully Electronic LSRs             | LNP                                    | Benchmark  | 95.00%    | 173            | 173              | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-5B-(a) | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Resale Aggregate                       | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-5B-(b) | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | Unbundled Loop AGG-EELs                | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 21             | 21               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-5B-(c) | FOCs on Time for Electronic/Manual LSRs            | LNP                                    | Benchmark  | 90.00%    | 45             | 45               | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-5D     | FOCs provided for ASRs requesting LIS Trunks.      | LIS Trunk                              | Benchmark  | 85.00%    | 2              | 2                | 100.00%     |                         |                 |                   |              |                          |                  |              |
| August 2017 | Pre-Ordering | PO-9B     | Unbundled Loops                                    | Unbundled Loops and Number Portability | Parity     | N/A       | 0              | 2                | 0.00%       | 0.00%                   | 0               | 15                | 0.00%        | 0.00%                    |                  |              |

NORTH DAKOTA PAP SUMMARY - JULY 2018

| State | Reporting Period | PID     | PID Description | Product | Current Month Payment | Incremental Rerun Payment | Interest | Total Monthly Payment |
|-------|------------------|---------|-----------------|---------|-----------------------|---------------------------|----------|-----------------------|
| ND    |                  | NO DATA |                 |         | .                     | .                         | .        | .                     |